Regular and chaotic phase space fraction in the double pendulum

Santiago Cabrera¹, Edson D. Leonel², Arturo C. Marti¹

¹Instituto de Física, Universidad de la República, Igua 4225, 11400 Montevideo, Uruguay

²Departamento de Física - Universidade Estadual Paulista - Unesp,

Av.24A, 1515, Bela Vista, CEP, 13506-700 Rio Claro, SP, Brazil

The double coplanar pendulum is an example of the coexistence of regular and chaotic dynamics for equal energy values but different initial conditions. Regular trajectories predominate for low energies; as the energy is increased, the system passes through values where chaotic trajectories are abundant, and then, increasing the energy further, it is again dominated by regular trajectories. Given that the energetically accessible states are bounded, a relevant question is about the fraction of phase space regular or chaotic trajectories as the energy varies. In this paper, we calculate the relative abundance of chaotic trajectories in phase space, characterizing the trajectories using the maximum Lyapunov exponent, and find that, for low energies, it grows exponentially.

I. INTRODUCTION

In chaotic systems, instead of looking for long-term predictions about the solutions, which are essentially impossible to obtain, it is helpful to know the general properties of their evolution. An essential feature of Hamiltonian dynamical systems is the coexistence of regular and chaotic trajectories for different initial conditions^{1,2}. The non-trivial combination of these trajectories gives rise to critical phenomena such as dynamical traps³ and anomalous diffusion⁴. One aspect that has been little studied is the fraction of chaotic and regular trajectories as we vary the system parameters. To answer this question meaningfully, we must place ourselves in phase space where, thanks to Liouville's theorem, the volume is conserved under canonical transformations and especially during the time evolution given by the equations of motion⁵.

The double pendulum is a captivating and illustrative example within chaos theory, showcasing the sensitivity to initial conditions inherent in nonlinear dynamical systems. In the context of chaos, the motion of a double pendulum is notoriously unpredictable, as slight variations in the starting positions or initial velocities can lead to vastly different trajectories over time. This sensitivity to initial conditions is a hallmark of chaos where tiny perturbations can result in significant deviations from the expected behavior. This chaotic behavior results from the nonlinear equations governing the double pendulum's motion.

Nonlinear descriptions, often formulated using the Lagrangian or Hamiltonian formalism, are crucial in understanding the dynamics of the double pendulum. The Lagrangian approach allows for a concise and elegant representation of the system's kinetic and potential energy, yielding the equations of motion through the principle of least action. Alternatively, the Hamiltonian formalism provides insights into the system's energy conservation and phase space dynamics, offering a different perspective on the chaotic behavior of the double pendulum. Researchers often leverage these formalisms to analyze the intricate dynamics of chaotic systems, providing a foundation for understanding chaotic phenomena in diverse fields.

The applicability of the double pendulum extends beyond mere theoretical curiosity, finding relevance in various disciplines such as physics^{6,7}, engineering⁸, and even in the study of biological systems⁹. Engineers and physicists use double pendulums as a testbed for chaotic behavior in mechanical systems, helping to design and optimize systems that can tolerate and control chaotic dynamics. By exploring chaotic dynamics in the double pendulum, researchers gain valuable insights into the broader implications of chaos theory and its potential applications in real-world scenarios.

The distinction between regular and chaotic behavior is relevant to the dynamical evolution of stellar systems. In Ref.¹⁰, the abundance of regular and chaotic orbits has been studied considering the non-zero Lyapunov exponent and show that their spatial distributions substantially differ. In another approach, Manos and Athanssoula¹¹ found that in a galactic model reduced to 2 degrees of freedom, the fraction of chaotic trajectories is a non-monotonic function of the energy. This information is vital in galaxy formation models, a particularly active area in astrophysics, where the formation of structures strongly depends on the orbits and morphology of the celestial objects involved.

The planar double pendulum is a paradigmatic system with chaotic dynamics^{12–14}. In the low and high energy extremes, it possesses excellent regularity in its motion - by theoretical predictions. There is an intermediate energy range between them where essentially all initial conditions result in chaotic motion. This paper's main objective is the study of the transition between regular and chaotic behavior from a global perspective in the double-plane pendulum. With this aim, we calculate the fraction of initial conditions corresponding to a section of the phase space, in this case, the Poincaré section, that leads to a chaotic evolution. The results reported here concern a relevant and paradigmatic system, such as the double pendulum, and could be extended to various scenarios. The following section discusses the general aspects of the double pendulum dynamics. We report the most relevant results concerning the phase space fraction of chaotic trajectories in Section III. Finally, SectionIV provides a brief conclusion.

II. THE DOUBLE PENDULUM

A. General description of the dynamics

A planar double pendulum is a physical system consisting of two pendulums attached end-to-end, in which the second pendulum is suspended from the lower end of the first. Each pendulum consists of point masses, m_1 and m_2 , attached to the end of massless strings, lengths l_1 and l_2 , allowing them to swing under the influence of gravity, with gravitational acceleration g, in a single vertical plane. As this system has two degrees of freedom and only one conserved quantity, the mechanical energy, it exhibits complex and chaotic behavior depending on the parameter values and the initial conditions. This system is often used in physics and mathematics to illustrate chaotic and regular behavior from theoretical or experimental perspectives¹². In Fig. 1 we show a system diagram where the angles with respect to the vertical, φ , and ψ , are taken as generalized coordinates.



Figure 1. Schematic diagram of the planar double pendulum.

The dynamics of this system can be analyzed using either the Lagrangian or the Hamiltonian formalism. To begin with, we can express the position of the masses in terms of φ and ψ , as $x_1 = l_1 \sin \varphi$ and $y_1 = -l_1 \cos \varphi$, and $x_2 = l_1 \sin \varphi + l_2 \sin \psi$, $y_2 = -l_1 \cos \varphi - l_2 \cos \psi$. The Lagrangian can be written as

$$L = \frac{1}{2}m_1 l_1^2 \dot{\varphi}^2 + \frac{1}{2}m_2 (l_1^2 \dot{\varphi}^2 + l_2^2 \dot{\psi}^2 + 2l_1 l_2 \dot{\varphi} \dot{\psi} \cos(\psi - \varphi)) - m_1 g l_1 \cos\varphi - m_2 g (l_1 \cos\varphi + l_2 \cos\psi).$$
(1)

The equations of motion can be easily found from the Euler-Lagrange equations as

$$(m_1 + m_2)l_1^2 \ddot{\varphi} + m_2 l_1 l_2 (\ddot{\psi} \cos(\psi - \varphi) - \dot{\psi}^2 \sin(\psi - \varphi)) + (m_1 + m_2) l_1 g \sin \varphi = 0$$
(2)

and

$$m_2 l_2 \ddot{\psi} + m_2 l_1 l_2 (\ddot{\varphi} \cos(\psi - \varphi) \dot{\varphi}^2 \sin(\psi - \varphi)) + m_2 l_2 g \sin \psi = 0$$
(3)

Throughout this work, we study the system's dynamics by analyzing the Poincaré sections and calculating the Lyapunov characteristic exponents described in the following Subsections. With these objectives in mind, we integrate numerically the equations of motion using a standard 4th-5th order Runge-Kutta method¹⁵. The parameter values are $m_1 = m_2 = 1$, $l_1 = l_2 = 1$ and g = 9.81. Thanks to the numerical integration, we obtain the temporal evolution of the generalized coordinates and velocities of $\varphi(t)$, $\psi(t)$, $\dot{\varphi}(t)$ and $\dot{\psi}(t)$. Although it is simpler to work with the Lagrangian formalism since we are interested in the fraction of chaotic trajectories in phase space, we must also calculate the generalized momenta

$$p_i = \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{q}_i}.\tag{4}$$

Then, from the numerical integration of the generalized coordinates and momenta, we obtain the momenta expressed as $p_i(t) = p_i(q_i(t), \dot{q}_i(t))$. This aspect is essential for finding the Lyapunov exponents and the fraction of chaotic trajectories defined in the phase space where Hamiltonian mechanics occurs.

To conclude this summary, two limited dynamical behaviors are worth mentioning. The first case is the limit of small oscillations. In that case, the equations of motion reduce to a pair of easily integrable second-order linear equations. Therefore, the orbits are regular, and according to the ratio of the normal modes frequencies ω_1 and ω_2 , the generic motion will be periodic or quasiperiodic. This limit corresponds to a low-energy case where the system does not move too far from its equilibrium position. The null energy E = 0 corresponds to both pendulums in the equilibrium position with velocities equal to zero. Let us note that by slightly increasing the energy so that the motions do not move too far away from the equilibrium position, the equations of motion are no longer linear but remain integrable. That is, the system describes non-harmonic oscillations. At the other end of the spectrum, the gravitational potential energy becomes negligible for high energies compared to the kinetic energy, and the perpendicular component of the angular momentum is approximately conserved. In this limit, the system's dynamics are composed of ordered trajectories again. In short, the double pendulum presents ordered dynamics in the low and high energy limits. In contrast, in an intermediate range of energies, its trajectories through the phase space are mainly chaotic. This work's primary focus is verifying this prediction and quantitatively analyzing the order-chaos-order transition.

The double pendulum has two degrees of freedom and one conserved quantity, so the mechanical energy and dynamics occur in a three-dimensional hypersurface. Following the criterion used by Korsch et al.¹⁶, we consider two-dimensional Poincaré sections corresponding to the points where the outer pendulum crosses the vertical in a counter-clockwise direction

$$\psi = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad l_2 \dot{\psi} + l_1 \dot{\varphi} \cos \varphi > 0.$$
 (5)

Depending on the value of the mechanical energy, the system exhibits different behaviors that can be appreciated using Poincaré sections. We can see in Fig. 2 three characteristic dynamical behaviors for an energy E = 15J

- Finite sets of intersections. They correspond to periodic motions: the trajectory crosses the section through the same points after a time, for example, the red point in the center of the stable island that we find towards the center of the Poincaré section.
- Curve filling points (invariant curves) associated with quasiperiodic dynamics: the motion is regular but never passes through the same point twice (represented in black).
- Area filling points, associated with chaotic trajectories: the trajectory crosses the Poincaré section erratically, without following any regularity or crossing the same threshold twice (blue regions).

We also note that the energetically accessible states in the Poincaré section are bounded, indicated in this figure by a green dashed closed line.



Figure 2. Poincaré section for an energy value (E = 15J) with coexistence of different dynamics. The left panel shows a global view where the dashed green curve represents the boundary of the energetically accessible region. Periodic motion is exemplified by the red point corresponding to orbits crossing the section at a single point. The right panel shows an enlargement of the region surrounding the red point. Black orbits whose intersections form continuous curves correspond to quasiperiodic dynamics, and the orbits whose intersections fill non-zero areas (blue regions) correspond to chaotic motions. The chaotic trajectories were integrated for 10^4 s, integrating the equations of motion for longer times would lead to additional filling in the blue areas.

C. Lyapunov characteristic exponents

As a complement to the analysis of the trajectories using Poincaré sections, we also consider the calculation of the Lyapunov characteristic exponents. In a conservative mechanical system with two degrees of freedom, there are two opposite pairs of Lyapunov exponents. One of them, parallel to the trajectories, corresponds to null values. Therefore, the spectrum of Lyapunov exponents is $(-\lambda, 0, 0, \lambda)$ and can be characterized entirely by λ , the maximum Lyapunov

exponent (MLE). To numerically calculate the MLE, we use a popular algorithm based on a convergent iterative calculation¹⁷ extensively used in the literature^{13,16}. The MLE can take positive values in the case of chaotic dynamics or a null value for regular solutions, which include periodic or quasiperiodic behavior. Typically, computing the MLE involves integrating the equations of motion over extended time intervals. Due to the slow convergence, discerning between a positive or zero MLE becomes a subtle process. In Subsection III C, we elaborate on the criteria employed to make this crucial distinction.

III. PHASE SPACE FRACTION OF CHAOTIC TRAJECTORIES

A. Algorithm

We can determine the Poincaré section fraction corresponding to chaotic trajectories with the tools presented in the previous sections. There are several techniques to approximate what percentage of initial conditions result in the chaotic motion of the system. One of the techniques¹⁸ compares the area occupied by the chaotic trajectories by connecting the points corresponding to intersections of such orbits with the section forming triangles with a Delaunay triangulation. In this work, we propose another technique exploiting the tools we have introduced, which gives results comparable to those of the article above in less computer time. Our algorithm is inspired by the well-known Monte Carlo method. The procedure involves the following steps:

- 1. For a given energy, we find the maximum and minimum values of φ and $\dot{\varphi}$. For large energies where the inner pendulum can make a full rotation, we consider the range $[-\pi,\pi]$ for φ .
- 2. We define a grid of initial conditions $(\varphi_0, \dot{\varphi}_0)$ in the region $[\varphi_{\min}, \varphi_{\max}] \times [\dot{\varphi}_{\min}, \dot{\varphi}_{\max}]$
- 3. For each initial condition, we take $\psi_0 = 0$, and calculate the corresponding $\dot{\psi}_0$ which verifies the Eq. (5) using the equations of motion. If the points lie in the Poincaré section, there is a solution for $\dot{\psi}_0$ because they belong to the energy hypersurface of the system. We then have a vector of initial conditions in the configurations space, which are converted to the phase space using the canonical momenta definitions. We thus obtain a set of canonical initial conditions for each grid point in the Poincaré section.
- 4. For each initial condition, we integrate the equation of motion for sufficiently long periods and then calculate the MLE.
- 5. We determine whether the value found corresponds to a regular or a chaotic orbit according to the criterion exposed in Subsection III C.
- 6. Finally, after integrating all the initial conditions for a given energy, we sum the number of chaotic trajectories and divide by the total initial conditions.

B. Poincaré sections and MLE as a function of the energy

To verify the performance of the method and to be able to analyze some aspects of the motion, we obtained Poincaré sections for representative values of the energy. To get these sections, we used the numerical integrator we mentioned, ode45, and the intersection points were found with the integrator built-in function, *events*, which allows us to obtain specific topics of interest of the trajectory. Precisely, we determine the points of the circuit verifying conditions are given by Eq. (5). The results are consistent with those obtained in the literature^{18,19}.

Regular and chaotic trajectories are distinguishable in Fig. 3: filling area points corresponding to chaotic trajectories and filling curves points or isolated points corresponding to quasiperiodic or periodic orbits. In Fig. 3(a), for the given energy value the generic trajectories are quasiperiodic (frequency ratio is irrational). These trajectories surround two regions where the normal oscillation modes occur in the limit of small amplitudes. In the subsequent panels, we notice how these curves deform and decrease in size while chaotic regions emerge as the energy increases. We also note that for an energy of about E = 20J, the chaotic region is already considerable, and it can be seen that for an energy of about E = 30J, regular regions occur in a small region of the section.

Poincaré sections are compared with the MLE for energies of E = 15J and E = 20J to get a deeper insight. In Fig. 3(e) and (f), we represent colormaps of the MLE. It is remarkable an excellent agreement between panels (c) and (d), Poincaré sections, and (e) and (f) MLE. Therefore, we conclude that both techniques provide coherent results.



Figure 3. Poincaré sections (a, b, c, and d) and Lyapunov exponent (e and f) for different energies indicated in each panel. We observe that as the energy increases, the regions covered by chaotic trajectories increase to the detriment of those corresponding to regular orbits. We note a clear correspondence between the values of positive (null) MLE and the chaotic (regular) regions. The MLE colormaps (e and f) comprise results calculated on a grid of 1200×1200 initial conditions in the Poincaré section.

C. Criterion for positive MLE

One point that is worth exploring further is the criterion used to classify the null or positive values of the MLE, $\lambda = 0$ or $\lambda > 0$, for each point in the last step of the algorithm detailed in III A. The chosen criterion is relevant because it is based on estimating the limit of a series by a finite sum. Hence, even if the limit is zero, it is not possible to obtain precisely a null value in finite times. To establish this criterion, we studied the statistical distribution of MLE. In Fig. 4 we can see a histogram of the distribution of MLE varying the initial conditions but keeping the energy fixed in two different values (E = 15J or E = 175J which correspond to panels (c) and (d) of Fig. 3). The histograms reveal that although the MLE values do not take a single value, we can clearly distinguish two clusters, one close to zero and the other around a positive value. Comparing to the Poincaré section, we identify that the first cluster corresponds to $\lambda = 0$ and the second to $\lambda > 0$. This fact allows us to establish a threshold to determine whether a calculated MLE value is zero or positive.

It is worth mentioning that the ranges of values corresponding to a null MLE may vary. In general, we observe that by keeping the number of iterations fixed and increasing the energy, the convergence is slower, an event that leads to the MLE values of the stable regions obtained being higher for higher energies. We can appreciate this phenomenon in Fig. 4. There, we see how the values corresponding to the 0 region for an energy of 175J are more significant than those of 15J. However, contrasting again with the Poincaré sections, we can corroborate that the initial conditions whose exponents fall within this first region of the histogram (for energy 175J) correspond to quasiperiodic trajectories, curves in the Poincaré section, and the same with the points in the second region of the histogram with the chaotic zones. Therefore, we adopt this criterion to classify the MLE as null or positive. We also note that MLE values obtained are consistent with other studies on the subject¹³, for example, values of the order of 10^{-2} for low energies.



Figure 4. MLE histogram for E = 15J and E = 175J overlapped. Values are distributed in two regions: the $\lambda \sim 0$ region is associated with quasiperiodic orbits, while the $\lambda > 0$ region corresponds with chaotic orbits.

D. Chaotic fraction in the Poincaré section

By obtaining and classifying the maximum Lyapunov exponents for the grid points in the Poincaré sections, we can approximate the fraction associated with chaotic or regular motions as

Chaotic fraction =
$$\frac{\text{Number of chaotic initial conditions}}{\text{Total number of initial conditions}}$$
. (6)

the objective is the variation of this fraction as a function of the system's mechanical energy. For this study, simulations were performed on a grid of 100×100 points of the Poincaré section, sweeping energies between 1J and 2000J. For



Figure 5. Chaotic fraction of the system as a function of energy. On the upper right, we appreciate a detail of the results for low energies. We note how the initial value is zero, then grows with E until reaching the maximum value 1, and then decreases for high energies.

each initial condition, a reference orbit of 1000 s was integrated, and 400 initial conditions close to this were taken for the calculation of the MLE, integrating each short period of 2.5 s and then resetting the close initial condition.

In Fig. 5, we can see the global behavior of the chaotic fraction as a function of the energy. We note, particularly in the inset corresponding low energies, that the chaotic fraction is almost zero for energies going to zero. This limit coincides with the region of validity of the small oscillations approximation in which the general motion of the pendulum is quasiperiodic and, therefore, non-chaotic. If we continue analyzing the Fig. 5, we see that as energy increases, the chaotic fraction begins to increase in the same way, eventually almost covering the entire Poincaré section for values greater than E = 25J. Then, as the energy continues to grow, we notice that, at approximately E = 100J, its value begins to decrease, and it does so monotonically in the range of energies shown. Because of the regularity of the system as the energy increases, as we approach the integrable limit at high energies, we expect the monotonic decrease to be robust. This behavior, a "linearity \rightarrow chaos \rightarrow linearity transition " appears to be common to several simple chaotic conservative systems, such as a set of rotors¹⁸ or a double pendulum formed by square plates¹⁹, and probably to many more, where in particular we have integrable limits at the two extremes of the energy range. This is one of the relevant conclusions of the work.

One issue that arises, mainly from analyzing the low energy region depicted in Fig. 5, is the initial growth rate of the chaotic fraction. The calculations were repeated in the low energy regions, varying E from 0.05J to study this. The behavior described by the chaotic fraction, for values of up to E = 10.5J, is very satisfactorily fitted by an exponential curve. The coefficient of determination for such a fit is $r^2 = 0.998$. Not surprisingly, the fit is not appropriate for higher energies because the chaotic fraction, bounded to its maximum value, 1, must decrease its slope. In Fig. 6, we can see the values obtained for the chaotic fraction for low energies with the exponential fit. We can appreciate an excellent agreement between the fit and the numerical data for this energy range. It is interesting to ask how much we can extrapolate this behavior to other systems. This raises a question for future work on the subject. It would be exciting to analyze other simple systems and study if they present this characteristic of initial exponential growth of the chaotic fraction.

IV. CONCLUSION

In this paper, we studied the dynamics of a double-plane pendulum, particularly the fraction of regular and chaotic trajectories as a function of the system's mechanical energy. By analyzing Poincaré sections, we could appreciate how, as the energy increases, the stable regions of the phase space - those associated with quasiperiodic trajectories - yield space to the chaotic ones - related to erratic orbits, without any regularity. Eventually, the system's motion reaches a state of global chaos - any initial condition given to it leads to chaotic motion.

This transition was analyzed quantitatively using the numerical calculation of the maximum Lyapunov exponent. Using a discretization of the Poincaré section (through a grating), we could estimate the chaotic fraction of the initial



Figure 6. Chaotic fraction for low energies. On the numerically obtained data, an exponential fit is used. We can appreciate that the behavior fits very satisfactorily by the exponential, up to a value of E = 10.5J approximately.

conditions in the phase space as the quotient between those associated with chaotic orbits and the total number for a given energy. In agreement with the theoretical predictions we explained in II A, we could appreciate, for example, in Fig. 5, how the system has a high regularity for very low or very high energies. In both cases, the system's motion is orderly; we may be in the Hamiltonian's integrable limits that describe its evolution. On the other hand, we verify that for an intermediate range of energies, essentially every initial condition leads to a chaotic trajectory. Therefore, and as we expected theoretically, the single, double pendulum undergoes an integrability transition \rightarrow chaos \rightarrow integrability.

We focused more on the region of energies where the chaotic fraction grows, starting from its null value in the limit of small oscillations. We see the detail in Fig. 6. We verified that in a range of energies up to about 10.5J, the growth of the chaotic fraction fits very well with an exponential curve. For future work, the most remarkable is this last mentioned result, the exponential growth of the chaotic fraction for low energies.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Most numerical experiments were performed using resources from ClusterUY (https://cluster.uy), a national supercomputing center that allows high-performance scientific computations. The simulations took approximately 500 CPU hours with 20 Intel Xeon-Gold 6138 cores. E.D.L. acknowledges support from Brazilian agencies CNPq (No. 301318/2019-0) and FAPESP (No. 2019/14038-6 and No. 2021/09519-5).

¹ V. I. Arnold, Mathematical methods of classical mechanics, Vol. 60 (Springer Science & Business Media, 2013).

 ² A. J. Lichtenberg and M. A. Lieberman, *Regular and stochastic motion*, Vol. 38 (Springer Science & Business Media, 2013).
 ³ G. Zaslavsky, Physica D: Nonlinear Phenomena 168, 292 (2002).

⁴ R. Ishizaki, T. Horita, and H. Mori, Progress of theoretical physics **89**, 947 (1993).

- ⁵ G. Herbert, P. Charles, and S. John, *Classical mechanics* (Addison-Wesley, New York, NY, 2000).
- 6 A. C. Luo and C. Guo, Journal of Vibration Testing and System Dynamics 3, 259 (2019).
- $\overline{7}$ S. D'Alessio, European Journal of Physics 44, 015002 (2022).
- ⁸ Z. Laouina, L. Ouchaouka, M. Moussetad, S. Mordane, and M. Radid, Procedia Computer Science **210**, 317 (2022).
- ⁹ Y. Bazargan-Lari, M. Eghtesad, A. Khoogar, and A. Mohammad-Zadeh, Journal of Biomedical Physics & Engineering 4, 91 (2014).
- ¹⁰ J. C. Muzzio, D. D. Carpintero, and F. C. Wachlin, Celestial Mechanics and Dynamical Astronomy 91, 173 (2005).
 ¹¹ T. Manos and E. Athanassoula, Monthly Notices of the Royal Astronomical Society 415, 629 (2011).
- ¹² T. Shinbrot, C. Grebogi, J. Wisdom, and J. A. Yorke, American Journal of Physics **60**, 491 (1992).
 ¹³ T. Stachowiak and T. Okada, Chaos, Solitons & Fractals **29**, 417 (2006).
- ¹⁴ A. M. Calvão and T. J. P. Penna, European Journal of Physics **36**, 045018 (2015).
- ¹⁵ T. M. Inc, "ode45," https://la.mathworks.com/help/matlab/ref/ode45.html?lang=en, Accessed on 12/11/2023.
- ¹⁶ H. J. Korsch, T. Hartmann, and H.-J. Jodl, *Chaos: a program collection for the PC* (Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg, New York, NY, 2008).
- ¹⁷ A. Wolf, J. B. Swift, H. L. Swinney, and J. A. Vastano, Physica D: Nonlinear Phenomena **16**, 285 (1985).
- ¹⁸ G. S. Krishnaswami and H. Senapati, Chaos: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Nonlinear Science 29, 123121 (2019).
- ¹⁹ M. Rafat, M. Wheatland, and T. Bedding, American Journal of Physics 77, 216 (2009).